

Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

Jordan v. Western Farmers Elec. Coop.

290 P.3d 9 (Okla. 2012) 11/13/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Controls Components, Ltd. v. Weaver

301 P.3d 405 (Okla. 2013) 2/5/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Sheffer v. Carolina Forge Co., L.L.C.

306 P.3d 544 (Okla. 2013) 6/25/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

King v. Berryhill Fire Prot. Dist.

311 P.3d 836 (Okla. 2013) 9/25/2013

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

City of Jenks v. Stone

321 P.3d 179 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 2/25/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

MacDonald v. Corporate Integris Health

326 P.3d 980 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.; NDO) 2/25/2014

Disposition: Certified question answered

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Brewer v. City of Seminole

326 P.3d 1143 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.; NDO) 5/13/2014

Disposition: Certified question answered

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Price v. Board of County Comm'rs of Pawnee County

371 P.3d 1089 (Okla. 2016) 2/17/2016

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Hudson	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Lumpkin	Concur	-
Reif	NP	NP
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	NP	NP

Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

Moore v. Warr Acres Nursing Ctr., LLC

376 P.3d 894 (Okla. 2016) 3/8/2016

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Tiger v. Verdigris Valley Elec. Coop.

2016 WL 3457729 (Okla. 2016) 6/21/2016

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

Benson v. Leaders Life Ins. Co.

339 P.3d 843 (Okla. 2012) 12/18/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

City of Choctaw v. Oklahoma Mun. Assurance Group

302 P.3d 1164 (Okla. 2013) 1/22/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

Porter v. Oklahoma Farm Bureau Mut. Ins. Co.

330 P.3d 511 (Okla. 2014) 6/17/2014

Disposition: Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur/Dissent	-

Chandler v. Valentine

330 P.3d 1209 (Okla. 2014) 7/3/2014

Disposition: Vacated

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

Board of County Comm'rs of Delaware County v. Association of County Comm'rs of Oklahoma Self-Ins. Group

339 P.3d 866 (Okla. 2014) 10/21/2014

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

Trinity Baptist Church v. Brotherhood Mut. Ins. Servs., LLC

341 P.3d 75 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 12/9/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur/Dissent	-
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Broom v. Wilson Paving & Excavating, Inc.

356 P.3d 617 (Okla. 2015) 4/7/2015

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Johnson	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Serra v. Estate of Broughton

364 P.3d 637 (Okla. 2015) 12/8/2015

Disposition: Vacated

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

Leritz v. Farmers Ins. Co., Inc.

2016 WL 3586902 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Medical Malpractice Cases

Parris v. Limes

277 P.3d 1259 (Okla. 2012) 3/6/2012

Disposition: Affirmed in part, reversed in part
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	Ø
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Fields v. Saunders

278 P.3d 577 (Okla. 2012) 3/6/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	NP	NP
Winchester	Dissent	+

Ledbetter v. Howard

276 P.3d 1031 (Okla. 2012) 4/24/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Dissent	+
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Wall v. Marouk

302 P.3d 775 (Okla. 2013) 6/4/2013

Disposition: Overruled
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Medical Malpractice Cases

Smith v. Hines

362 P.3d 646 (Okla. 2013) 7/2/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Allen v. Harrison

2016 WL 1567600 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Nelson v. Enid Med. Assocs., Inc.

2016 WL 3342133 (Okla. 2016) 6/14/2016

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	NP	NP
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Covel v. Rodriguez

272 P.3d 705 (Okla. 2012) (1st Imp.) 1/31/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Harris v. David Stanley Chevrolet, Inc.

273 P.3d 877 (Okla. 2012) 2/7/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Dissent	+
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

James v. Tyson Foods, Inc.

292 P.3d 10 (Okla. 2012) (1st Imp.) 3/6/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	NP	NP
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Samson Res. Co. v. Newfield Exploration Mid-Continent, Inc.

281 P.3d 1278 (Okla. 2012) 7/3/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	+
Taylor	NP	NP
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Harmon v. Craddock

286 P.3d 643 (Okla. 2012) 9/18/2012

Disposition: Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	NP	NP
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Slawson v. Board of County Comm'rs of Logan County

288 P.3d 533 (Okla. 2012) 10/23/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	-

Bank of Beaver City v. Barretts' Livestock, Inc.

295 P.3d 1088 (Okla. 2012) (1st Imp.) 10/30/2012

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+

Croslin v. Enerlex, Inc.

308 P.3d 1041 (Okla. 2013) 5/28/2013

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Douglas v. Cox Ret. Props., Inc.

302 P.3d 789 (Okla. 2013) 6/4/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Bosh v. Cherokee County Bldg. Auth.

305 P.3d 994 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp.) 6/28/2013

Disposition: Certified questions answered
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Mastercraft Floor Covering, Inc. v. Charlotte Flooring, Inc.

313 P.3d 911 (Okla. 2013) 10/22/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Widner v. Enerlex, Inc.

313 P.3d 930 (Okla. 2013) 10/29/2013

Disposition: Reversed
Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Krug v. Helmerich & Payne, Inc.

320 P.3d 1012 (Okla. 2013) 12/10/2013

Disposition: Affirmed in part, reversed in part

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	NP	NP
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

Guffey v. Ostonakulov

321 P.3d 971 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 2/11/2014

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Fisch v. Stuart

362 P.3d 648 (Okla. 2014) 6/19/2014

Disposition: Writ granted

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	+
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Wood v. Mercedes-Benz of Oklahoma City

336 P.3d 457 (Okla. 2014) 7/16/2014

Disposition: Vacated

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Boler v. Security Health Care, L.L.C.

336 P.3d 468 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 9/30/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Marshall County, Oklahoma v. Homesales, Inc.

339 P.3d 878 (Okla. 2014) 10/28/2014

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Fischer	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Johnson v. Convalescent Ctr. of Grady County, LLC

341 P.3d 71 (Okla. 2014) 11/25/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Montgomery v. Potter

341 P.3d 660 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.; NDO) 12/6/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Parsons v. Volkswagen of Am., Inc.

341 P.3d 662 (Okla. 2014) 12/16/2014

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	NP	NP
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Perry v. City of Norman

341 P.3d 689 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 12/16/2014

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+

Horton v. Hamilton

345 P.3d 357 (Okla. 2015) 2/10/2015

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Walker v. BuildDirect.com Techs., Inc.

349 P.3d 549 (Okla. 2015) (1st Imp.; NDO) 5/5/2015

Disposition: Certified Question Answered

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Fargo v. Hays-Kuehn

352 P.3d 1223 (Okla. 2015) 6/30/2015

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Kenkel v. Parker

362 P.3d 1145 (Okla. 2015) 11/24/2015

Disposition: Vacated

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Gowens v. Barstow

364 P.3d 644 (Okla. 2015) 12/15/2015

Disposition: Vacated

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Dani v. Miller

374 P.3d 779 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.; NDO) 3/29/2016

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

Watkins v. Central State Griffin Mem'l Hosp.

377 P.3d 124 (Okla. 2016) 6/21/2016

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Lee v. Bueno

2016 WL 5115314 (Okla. 2016) 9/20/2016

Disposition: Affirmed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur/Dissent	-
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Product Liability Cases

Howard v. Zimmer, Inc.

299 P.3d 463 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp.) 3/19/2013

Disposition: Certified question answered

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Nomac Drilling LLC v. Mowdy

277 P.3d 1282 (Okla. 2012) 5/8/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Yzer, Inc. v. Rodr

280 P.3d 323 (Okla. 2012) 6/5/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Zaloudek Grain Co. v. CompSource Oklahoma

298 P.3d 520 (Okla. 2012) 9/18/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Williams Cos., Inc. v. Dunkelgod

295 P.3d 1107 (Okla. 2012) 11/20/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur/Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur/Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur/Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Rural Waste Mgmt & Indem. Ins. Co. of N. Am. v. Mock

292 P.3d 24 (Okla. 2012) 12/4/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Prince v. Brake Rebuilders & Friction Prods., Inc.

298 P.3d 529 (Okla. 2012) 12/4/2012

Disposition: Reversed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Hogg v. Oklahoma County Juvenile Bureau

292 P.3d 29 (Okla. 2012) (1st Imp.) 12/11/2012

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Bertrand v. Laura Dester Ctr.

300 P.3d 1188 (Okla. 2013) 4/2/2013

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Joe Brown Co., Inc. v. Melton

307 P.3d 342 (Okla. 2013) 7/2/2013

Disposition: Reversed

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

Valued Servs., L.L.C. v. Tregenza

311 P.3d 839 (Okla. 2013) 10/1/2013

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Holley v. Ace Am. Ins. Co.

313 P.3d 917 (Okla. 2013) 10/22/2013

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Cattlemen's Steakhouse, Inc. v. Waldenville

318 P.3d 1105 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp.; NDO) 11/12/2013

Disposition: Sustained

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Graham Pub. Schs. v. Priddy

328 P.3d 1190 (Okla. 2014) 4/22/2014

Disposition: Reversed

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Kentucky Fried Chicken of McAlester v. Snell

345 P.3d 351 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 4/29/2014

Disposition: Reversed and Remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	NP	NP
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Peoplelink, LLC v. Bear

2014 WL 2958314 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 7/1/2014

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Wrote Opinion	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Carbajal v. Precision Builders, Inc.

333 P.3d 258 (Okla. 2014) 7/3/2014

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

*Multiple Injury Trust Fund v. Cellino

347 P.3d 293 (Okla. 2015) 3/10/2015

*Rated on the issue of whether class actions are available in Workers' Compensation Court.

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur*	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur*	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	-

Ball v. Multiple Injury Trust Fund

360 P.3d 499 (Okla. 2015) 10/13/2015

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Positive Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

Torres v. Seaboard Foods, LLC

2016 WL 805519 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 3/4/2016

Disposition: Reversed and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

Maxwell v. Sprint PCS

369 P.3d 1079 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 4/12/2016

Disposition: Vacated in part, reversed and remanded in part

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Robinson v. Fairview Fellowship Home for Senior Citizens, Inc. 371 P.3d 477 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016 Disposition: Reversed and remanded Negative Effect	Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester	Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur	Judge's Rating - - - - - - - -
---	--	---	---

Department of Human Servs. v. Bruce 371 P.3d 484 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016 Disposition: Vacated and remanded Negative Effect	Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester	Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Concur Dissent Concur Dissent	Judge's Rating - - - - - - + - +
---	--	--	--

Loyd v. Michelin N. Am., Inc. 371 P.3d 488 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 4/26/2016 Disposition: Reversed and remanded Negative Effect	Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester	Judge's Ruling NP Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Concur Dissent Concur Dissent	Judge's Rating NP - - - - - - + - +
---	--	--	--

Legarde-Bober v. Oklahoma State University 2016 WL 3577781 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016 Disposition: Reversed and remanded Negative Effect	Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester	Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Dissent Concur Dissent Concur Dissent	Judge's Rating - - - - - + - + - +
--	--	---	---

Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

Holliman v. Twister Drilling Co.

377 P.3d 133 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016

Disposition: Vacated

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

Vasquez v. Dillard's

2016 WL 4804078 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 9/13/2016

Disposition: Vacated and remanded

Negative Effect

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+