

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

---

## Controls Components, Ltd. v. Weaver

301 P.3d 405 (Okla. 2013) 2/5/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## Sheffer v. Carolina Forge Co., L.L.C.

306 P.3d 544 (Okla. 2013) 6/25/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## King v. Berryhill Fire Prot. Dist.

311 P.3d 836 (Okla. 2013) 9/25/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## City of Jenks v. Stone

321 P.3d 179 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 2/25/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

---

## MacDonald v. Corporate Integris Health

321 P.3d 980 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp., NDO) 2/25/2014

**Disposition:** Certified question answered

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Brewer v. City of Seminole

326 P.3d 1143 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp., NDO) 5/13/2014

**Disposition:** Certified question answered

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Price v. Board of County Comm'rs of Pawnee County

371 P.3d 1089 (Okla. 2016) 2/17/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Hudson	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Lumpkin	Concur	-
Reif	NP	NP
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	NP	NP

---

## Moore v. Warr Acres Nursing Ctr., LLC

376 P.3d 894 (Okla. 2016) 3/8/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Employment Cases

---

## **Tiger v. Verdigris Valley Elec. Coop.**

410 P.3d 1007 (Okla. 2016) 6/21/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## **Brisco v. State ex rel. Bd. of Regents of Agric. & Mech. Coll.**

394 P.3d 1251 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 5/2/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and reversed  
**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	Concur	+

---

## **Benedetti v. Cimarex Energy Co.**

415 P.3d 43 (Okla. 2018) 3/13/2018

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	NP	NP

---

## **Lind v. Barnes Tag Agency, Inc.**

418 P.3d 698 (Okla. 2018) (1st Imp.) 5/1/2018

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Darby	NP	NP
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	+
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Concur	-

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

---

## City of Choctaw v. Oklahoma Mun. Assurance Group

302 P.3d 1164 (Okla. 2013) 1/22/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

---

## Porter v. Oklahoma Farm Bureau Mut. Ins. Co.

330 P.3d 511 (Okla. 2014) 6/17/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur/Dissent	-

---

## Chandler v. Valentine

330 P.3d 1209 (Okla. 2014) 7/3/2014

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Board of County Comm'rs of Delaware County v. Association of County Comm'rs of Oklahoma Self-Ins. Group

339 P.3d 866 (Okla. 2014) 10/21/2014

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

---

## Trinity Baptist Church v. Brotherhood Mut. Ins. Servs., LLC

341 P.3d 75 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 12/9/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur/Dissent	-
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Broom v. Wilson Paving & Excavating, Inc.

356 P.3d 617 (Okla. 2015) 4/7/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Johnson	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Serra v. Estate of Broughton

364 P.3d 637 (Okla. 2015) 12/8/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Leritz v. Farmers Ins. Co., Inc.

385 P.3d 991 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

---

## Martin v. Gray

385 P.3d 64 (Okla. 2016) 11/8/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Falcone v. Liberty Mut. Ins. Co.

391 P.3d 105 (Okla. 2017) 2/14/2017

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur/Dissent	-
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur/Dissent	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Siloam Springs Hotel, LLC v. Century Sur. Co.

392 P.3d 262 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 2/22/2017

**Disposition:** Certified questions answered  
**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Buettner	Concur	+
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	-
Reif	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	NP	NP

---

## Hensley v. State Farm Fire & Cas. Co.

398 P.3d 11 (Okla. 2017) 6/20/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Insurance Cases

---

## Raymond v. Taylor

412 P.3d 1141 (Okla. 2017) 10/10/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

---

## State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Payne

408 P.3d 204 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 12/5/2017

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	NP	NP
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	Wrote Opinion	+

---

## JP Energy Mktg., LLC v. Commerce & Indus. Ins. Co.

419 P.3d 215 (Okla. 2018) (1st Imp.) 2/5/2018

**Disposition:** Granted and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	Ø
Reif	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur/Dissent	+

---

## Gaasch v. St. Paul Fire & Marine Ins. Co.

412 P.3d 1151 (Okla. 2018) 2/6/2018

**Disposition:** Affirmed  
**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Medical Malpractice Cases

---

## Wall v. Marouk

302 P.3d 775 (Okla. 2013) 6/4/2013

**Disposition:** Overruled

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Smith v. Hines

362 P.3d 646 (Okla. 2013) 7/2/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Allen v. Harrison

374 P.3d 812 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Maree v. Neuwirth

374 P.3d 750 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 6/7/2016

**Disposition:** Writ granted

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-



# Oklahoma Supreme Court Medical Malpractice Cases

---

## Nelson v. Enid Med. Assocs., Inc.

376 P.3d 212 (Okla. 2016) 6/14/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	NP	NP
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Andrew v. Depani-Sparkes

396 P.3d 210 (Okla. 2017) 5/16/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Bass	Concur	-
Colbert	Concur	-
Cunningham	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	NP	NP
McCall	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-

---

## Hurley v. Kirk

398 P.3d 7 (Okla. 2017) 6/20/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-

---

## John v. Saint Francis Hosp., Inc.

405 P.3d 681 (Okla. 2017) 10/25/2017

**Disposition:** Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	NP	NP

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

<p><b>Croslin v. Enerlex, Inc.</b> 308 P.3d 1041 (Okla. 2013) 5/28/2013</p> <p><b>Disposition:</b> Reversed <b>Negative Effect</b></p>	<p>Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester</p>	<p>Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Concur</p>	<p>Judge's Rating - - - - - - - - - -</p>
--	--	---	---

---

<p><b>Douglas v. Cox Ret. Props., Inc.</b> 302 P.3d 789 (Okla. 2013) 6/4/2013</p> <p><b>Disposition:</b> Reversed and remanded <b>Negative Effect</b></p>	<p>Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester</p>	<p>Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Concur Dissent Concur Dissent</p>	<p>Judge's Rating - - - - - - - + - +</p>
---	--	---	---

---

<p><b>Bosh v. Cherokee County Bldg. Auth.</b> 305 P.3d 994 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp.) 6/28/2013</p> <p><b>Disposition:</b> Certified questions answered <b>Negative Effect</b></p>	<p>Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester</p>	<p>Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Dissent Concur Dissent</p>	<p>Judge's Rating - - - - - - - + - +</p>
---	--	---	---

---

<p><b>Mastercraft Floor Covering, Inc. v. Charlotte Flooring, Inc.</b> 313 P.3d 911 (Okla. 2013) 10/22/2013</p> <p><b>Disposition:</b> Reversed and remanded <b>Negative Effect</b></p>	<p>Judge Colbert Combs Edmondson Gurich Kauger Reif Taylor Watt Winchester</p>	<p>Judge's Ruling Concur Concur Concur Concur Wrote Opinion Concur Dissent Concur Dissent</p>	<p>Judge's Rating - - - - - - - + - +</p>
---	--	---	---

---

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

<b>Widner v. Enerlex, Inc.</b>		Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
313 P.3d 930 (Okla. 2013) 10/29/2013		Colbert	Concur	-
<b>Disposition:</b>	Reversed	Combs	Concur	-
<b>Negative Effect</b>		Edmondson	Concur	-
		Gurich	Concur	-
		Kauger	Concur	-
		Reif	Concur	-
		Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
		Watt	Concur	-
		Winchester	Concur	-

<b>Krug v. Helmerich &amp; Payne, Inc.</b>		Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
320 P.3d 1012 (Okla. 2013) 12/10/2013		Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
<b>Disposition:</b>	Affirmed in part, reversed in part	Combs	Concur	+
<b>Positive Effect</b>		Edmondson	NP	NP
		Gurich	NP	NP
		Kauger	Concur	+
		Reif	Concur	+
		Taylor	Concur	+
		Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
		Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

<b>Guffey v. Ostonakulov</b>		Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
321 P.3d 971 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 2/11/2014		Colbert	Concur	-
<b>Disposition:</b>	Reversed and remanded	Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
<b>Negative Effect</b>		Edmondson	Concur	-
		Gurich	Concur	-
		Kauger	Concur	-
		Reif	Concur	-
		Taylor	Concur	-
		Watt	Concur	-
		Winchester	Concur	-

<b>Fisch v. Stuart</b>		Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
362 P.3d 648 (Okla. 2014) 6/19/2014		Colbert	Dissent	+
<b>Disposition:</b>	Writ granted	Combs	Concur	-
<b>Negative Effect</b>		Edmondson	Concur	-
		Gurich	Concur	-
		Kauger	Concur	-
		Reif	Concur	-
		Taylor	Dissent	+
		Watt	Concur	-
		Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Wood v. Mercedes-Benz of Oklahoma City

336 P.3d 457 (Okla. 2014) 7/16/2014

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Boler v. Security Health Care, L.L.C.

339 P.3d 468 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 9/30/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Marshall County, Oklahoma v. Homesales, Inc.

339 P.3d 878 (Okla. 2014) 10/28/2014

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Fischer	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur/Dissent	
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Johnson v. Convalescent Ctr. of Grady County, LLC

341 P.3d 71 (Okla. 2014) 11/25/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Montgomery v. Potter

341 P.3d 660 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp., NDO) 12/6/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	-

---

## Parsons v. Volkswagen of Am., Inc.

341 P.3d 662 (Okla. 2014) 12/16/2014

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	NP	NP
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Perry v. City of Norman

341 P.3d 689 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 12/16/2014

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Horton v. Hamilton

345 P.3d 357 (Okla. 2015) 2/10/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Walker v. BuildDirect.com Techs., Inc.

349 P.3d 549 (Okla. 2015) (1st Imp., NDO) 5/5/2015

**Disposition:** Certified question answered

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Fargo v. Hays-Kuehn

352 P.3d 1223 (Okla. 2015) 6/30/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Kenkel v. Parker

362 P.3d 1145 (Okla. 2015) 11/24/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Dissent	-
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Gowens v. Barstow

364 P.3d 644 (Okla. 2015) 12/15/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Dani v. Miller

374 P.3d 779 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp., NDO) 3/29/2016

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Watkins v. Central State Griffin Mem'l Hosp.

377 P.3d 124 (Okla. 2016) 6/21/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Lee v. Bueno

381 P.3d 736 (Okla. 2016) 9/20/2016

**Disposition:** Affirmed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur/Dissent	-
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Dissent	-
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Edwards v. Andrews

382 P.3d 1045 (Okla. 2016) 10/11/2016

**Disposition:** Writ issued

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	NP	NP
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Grisham v. City of Oklahoma City

404 P.3d 843 (Okla. 2017) 9/18/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur/Dissent	Ø
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-

---

## Boyle v. ASAP Energy, Inc.

408 P.3d 183 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 10/24/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

---

## Doe v. First Presbyterian Church U.S.A. of Tulsa

2017 WL 6478193 (Okla. 2017) 12/19/2017

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

---

## Cates v. Integris Health, Inc.

412 P.3d 98 (Okla. 2018) (1st Imp.) 1/30/2018

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	+
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Wrote Opinion	-



# Oklahoma Supreme Court Other Liability Lawsuits

---

## Ridings v. Maze

414 P.3d 835 (Okla. 2018) 3/6/2018

**Disposition:** Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	Ø
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+
Wyrick	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Product Liability Cases

---

## Howard v. Zimmer, Inc.

299 P.3d 463 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp.) 3/19/2013

**Disposition:** Certified question answered

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## American Honda Motor Co. Inc. v. Thygeson

416 P.3d 1059 (Okla. 2018) 2/13/2018

**Disposition:** Writ granted

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	Wrote Opinion	+

---

## Montgomery v. Airbus Helicopters, Inc.

414 P.3d 824 (Okla. 2018) 3/6/2018

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Dissent	-
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Wrote Opinion	+
Reif	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+
Wyrick	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## **Bertrand v. Laura Dester Ctr.**

300 P.3d 1188 (Okla. 2013) 4/2/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## **Joe Brown Co., Inc. v. Melton**

307 P.3d 342 (Okla. 2013) 7/2/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	+

---

## **Valued Servs., L.L.C. v. Tregenza**

311 P.3d 839 (Okla. 2013) 10/1/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## **Holley v. Ace Am. Ins. Co.**

313 P.3d 917 (Okla. 2013) 10/22/2013

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Cattlemen's Steakhouse, Inc. v. Waldenville

318 P.3d 1105 (Okla. 2013) (1st Imp., NDO) 11/12/2013

**Disposition:** Sustained

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## Graham Pub. Schs. v. Priddy

328 P.3d 1190 (Okla. 2014) 4/22/2014

**Disposition:** Reversed

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Kentucky Fried Chicken of McAlester v. Snell

345 P.3d 351 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 4/29/2014

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Concur	+
Taylor	NP	NP
Watt	Wrote Opinion	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Peoplelink, LLC v. Bear

373 P.3d 1019 (Okla. 2014) (1st Imp.) 7/1/2014

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	+
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Concur	+
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Wrote Opinion	+
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Carbajal v. Precision Builders, Inc.

333 P.3d 258 (Okla. 2014) 7/3/2014

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## \*Multiple Injury Trust Fund v. Cellino

347 P.3d 293 (Okla. 2015) 3/10/2015

\*Rated on the issue of whether class actions are available in Workers' Compensation Court.

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Dissent	-
Combs	Concur*	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur*	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Wrote Opinion	-

---

## Ball v. Multiple Injury Trust Fund

360 P.3d 499 (Okla. 2015) 10/13/2015

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Positive Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	+
Edmondson	Concur	+
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	+
Kauger	Concur	+
Reif	Dissent	-
Taylor	Concur	+
Watt	Concur	+
Winchester	Concur	+

---

## Torres v. Seaboard Foods, LLC

373 P.3d 1057 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 3/4/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Maxwell v. Sprint PCS

369 P.3d 1079 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 4/12/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated in part, reversed and remanded in part  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur/Dissent	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur/Dissent	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Robinson v. Fairview Fellowship Home for Senior Citizens, Inc.

371 P.3d 477 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-

---

## Department of Human Servs. v. Bruce

371 P.3d 484 (Okla. 2016) 4/19/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Loyd v. Michelin N. Am., Inc.

371 P.3d 488 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 4/26/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Holliman v. Twister Drilling Co.

377 P.3d 133 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Legarde-Bober v. Oklahoma State Univ.

378 P.3d 562 (Okla. 2016) 6/28/2016

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Vasquez v. Dillards

381 P.3d 768 (Okla. 2016) (1st Imp.) 9/13/2016

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Taylor	Dissent	+
Watt	Wrote Opinion	-
Winchester	Dissent	+

---

## Brown v. Claims Mgmt. Res. Inc.

391 P.3d 111 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 2/22/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated, reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	NP	NP

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Meeks v. Guarantee Ins. Co.

392 P.3d 278 (Okla. 2017) 2/28/2017

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	NP	NP

---

## Multiple Injury Trust Fund v. Garrett

408 P.3d 169 (Okla. 2017) 6/27/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	NP	NP
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

---

## Young v. Station 27, Inc.

404 P.3d 829 (Okla. 2017) 9/12/2017

**Disposition:** Affirmed in part, reversed in part, remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kay	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	NP	NP

---

## Corbeil v. Emricks Van & Storage, Guarantee Ins.

404 P.3d 856 (Okla. 2017) 9/19/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-



# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Graham v. D & K Oilfield Servs., Inc.

404 P.3d 863 (Okla. 2017) 9/19/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated, reversed in part, remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-

---

## Multiple Injury Trust Fund v. Mackey

406 P.3d 564 (Okla. 2017) 9/26/2017

**Disposition:** Vacated  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	NP	NP
Combs	Dissent	+
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Wrote Opinion	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+

---

## Gibby v. Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.

404 P.3d 44 (Okla. 2017) (1st Imp.) 10/3/2017

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Wrote Opinion	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Dissent	+
Kauger	Dissent	+
Reif	Concur	-
Watt	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	NP	NP

---

## Strickland v. Stephens Prod. Co.

411 P.3d 369 (Okla. 2018) (1st Imp., NDO) 1/23/2018

**Disposition:** Affirmed  
**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Wrote Opinion	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	NP	NP

# Oklahoma Supreme Court Workers' Compensation Cases

---

## Odom v. Penske Truck Leasing Co.

415 P.3d 521 (Okla. 2018) (1st Imp.) 3/13/2018

**Disposition:** Certified question answered

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Wrote Opinion	-
Edmondson	Concur	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Dissent	+
Winchester	Concur	-
Wyrick	Concur	-

---

## Pina v. American Piping Inspection, Inc.

419 P.3d 231 (Okla. 2018) 5/8/2018

**Disposition:** Reversed and remanded

**Negative Effect**

Judge	Judge's Ruling	Judge's Rating
Colbert	Concur	-
Combs	Concur	-
Darby	NP	NP
Edmondson	Wrote Opinion	-
Gurich	Concur	-
Kauger	Concur	-
Reif	Concur	-
Winchester	Dissent	+
Wyrick	Dissent	+